

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple

# COMPOSITE ASSESSMENT REVIEW BOARD DECISION HEARING DATE: MAY 13, 2019

PRESIDING OFFICER: D. PETRIUK

This decision pertains to a complaint submitted to the Central Alberta Regional Assessment Review Board, as provided by the *Municipal Government Act*, Revised Statutes of Alberta 2000, Chapter M-26 (the *Act*),

**BETWEEN:** 

ALTUS GROUP LIMITED (as represented by **Bennett Jones LLP**)

Complainant

-and-

THE CITY OF RED DEER (as represented by **Brownlee LLP**)

Respondent

in respect of multiple property assessments prepared by an Assessor of The City of Red Deer as follows:

ROLL NUMBER: MULTIPLE ROLLS (ATTACHED)
MUNICIPAL ADDRESS: MULTIPLE (ATTACHED)

This matter was heard by a one-member Composite Assessment Review Board on the 13 day of May 2019, at The City of Red Deer, in the province of Alberta.

Appeared on behalf of the Complainant: Alexis Teasdale, Bennett Jones LLP

Andrew Izard, Altus Group

Appeared on behalf of the Respondent: Greg Plester, Brownlee LLP

Maureen Cleary, The City of Red Deer Jason Miller, The City of Red Deer

#### **JURISDICTION**

[1] The Central Alberta Regional Assessment Review Board ["the Board"] has been established in accordance with section 455 of the *Municipal Government Act,* RSA 2000, c M-26 ["MGA"], and The City of Red Deer, Bylaw No. 3474/2011, Regional Assessment Review Board Bylaw (November 14, 2011).

#### PROPERTY DESCRIPTION AND BACKGROUND

[2] The properties that are the subject of this application (the "Properties") are listed in Appendix "A".

#### **PRELIMINARY MATTERS**

- [3] Neither party raised any objection to composition of the panel.
- [4] This was a preliminary hearing to set hearing dates for complaints related to the Properties. Both parties received notice of this hearing by way of a letter dated April 16, 2019 from the Clerk of the Regional Assessment Review Board. At the outset, the parties were advised that given space restrictions, any additional cost resulting from third party space being rented would be passed on to the parties.
- [5] No additional preliminary or procedural matters were raised by any party. Both parties indicated that they were prepared to proceed with the hearing.
- [6] The Board confirmed the submissions of the parties and entered the following Exhibits into the record:
  - C.1 Complainant's Preliminary Hearing Argument Submission (199 pages)
  - C.2 Complainant's Proposed Hearing Schedule (3 pages)
  - C.3 Respondent's Proposed Hearing Schedule (3 pages)
  - R.1 Respondent's Preliminary Hearing Submission (no page numbers)
  - R.2 Respondent's email dated May 6, 2019, with attachments (5 pages)
  - R.3 Assessment Review Board Complaints (no page numbers)
  - R.4 Respondent's Proposed Hearing Schedule (3 pages)

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple Page 3 of 10

#### **ISSUES**

[7] The only issue before the Board was how to schedule the complaints in respect of the Properties.

#### **POSITION OF THE PARTIES**

#### **Position of the Complainant**

- [8] The Complainant proposed that complaints with common issues be grouped and scheduled together to be heard on a rolling basis. This approach anticipates that the Complainant would present a common evidence package for each group and then that evidence would be carried forward to other files with the same issue or issues. The Complainant would also be able to present site specific evidence for each Complaint. The same agent would represent all Properties.
- [9] The Complainant argued that this was an efficient use of the Board's and the parties' time and resources. A common evidence package would mean that evidence common to a group of complaints would need to be presented only once and then carried forward to the balance of the hearings in that group. The Complainant also noted that in its experience, while the first complaint may take longer, any following complaints could proceed quickly as only site specific evidence would be specifically articulated.
- [10] The Complainant noted that having the same Board adjudicate complaints with common issues would favour consistency in decisions.
- [11] The Complainant's proposed hearing schedule (Exhibit C. 2) anticipates completion of all 70 hearings in 7 weeks, utilizing a Monday through Thursday hearing schedule. The Complainant argued that this was practical, as Friday could be used as a hearing day if necessary in any given week.

#### **Position of the Respondent**

- [12] The Respondent argued that the schedule proposed by the Complainant was too onerous and did not take into consideration the Respondent's scheduling constraints. Particularly, the Respondent argued that the Complainant's schedule would not allow the Respondent sufficient time to prepare for each hearing. The Respondent also argued that the Complainant's proposed schedule allowed for hearings after September 1, which was impossible for the Respondent given its other ongoing work and in particular roll preparation.
- [13] The Respondent argued that each hearing must be scheduled and heard separately. The Respondent argued that there was not enough overlap in the issues, ownership or property type to have the complaints grouped. Rather, any carry forward of evidence should be made on a case by case basis, at the hearing, and not in assumed in advance.
- [14] The schedule presented by the Respondent (Exhibit R.4) outlined each hearing proceeding separately, with up to three boardrooms (and Panels) running simultaneously, with the hearings to be completed in eight weeks, on a Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday schedule.

#### **Complainant's Rebuttal**

[15] The Complainant argued that it was unreasonable for the Respondent to provide a truncated hearing schedule, asserting that its assessors were unavailable from October to December, and on Mondays and Fridays, but then assert that the schedule provided by the Respondent did not provide adequate preparation time.

#### Joint Submission

[16] The hearing remained open until May 15 at 4pm, subsequently extended to May 16 at noon, to provide the parties with an opportunity to present a joint scheduling submission. The parties presented a joint hearing schedule, which is attached as Appendix "B". Appendix "B" outlines 5 weeks of hearings, beginning on July 22, 2019 and ending with the week of September 23, 2019. Hearings are not set to run continuously throughout this time. The only issue which remains to be decided is whether the hearings during the weeks of July 22, 2019, August 12, 2019 and August 19, 2019 should run from Monday to Thursday (the Complainant's request) or Tuesday to Friday (the Respondent's request). The parties have agreed that hearings will be held Monday through Friday for the balance of the hearing schedule.

#### **BOARD RULING and DECISION**

- [17] The parties are to be commended on their ability to reach an agreement with respect to the majority of the hearings.
- [18] Section 461(3) of the MGA provides that on receiving a complaint, the clerk must set a date, time and location for a hearing before an assessment review board in accordance with the regulations. The regulations then further direct the clerk as to scheduling and notice of hearing. If there is a dispute, as in this case, *Matters Relating to Assessment Complaints Regulation*, AR 310/2009, as amended ("MRAC") s. 42(1)(b) provides jurisdiction to a panel in procedural matters including the scheduling of a hearing.
- [19] Both parties have scheduling constraints. Each party has provided its own schedule in an attempt to accommodate staff and time availability. The Respondent has outlined its concerns regarding availability of staff along with the reality of its other ongoing commitments. The Complainant has indicated that the same agent is responsible for all Properties and provided a schedule to take that into consideration.
- [20] In order to ensure that both parties have an equal and fair opportunity to prepare and make their case, hearings for the week of July 22, 2019 shall be scheduled for Monday to Thursday and hearings for the weeks of August 12, 2019 and August 19, 2019 shall be scheduled for Tuesday to Friday. This allows roughly the same number of hearings in each of the parties' preferred times.

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple Page 5 of 10

- [21] The ruling in paragraph 20 above, along with Appendix "B" shall form the basis for the schedule for the hearings for the Properties all of which is subject to scheduling by the Clerk of the Regional Assessment Review Board.
- [22] The parties have agreed to a joint schedule, and in doing so have provided hearing dates which fall outside of the required timelines for notice requirements pursuant to MRAC s. 8. Accordingly, notice under MRAC s. 8 (d) is abridged pursuant to s. 11(1) of MRAC.
- [23] Dated at the Central Alberta Regional Assessment Review Board, in the city of Red Deer, in the Province of Alberta this 17<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2019 and signed by the Presiding Officer.

DEBORAH PETRIUK Presiding Officer

Screpiul

If you wish to appeal this decision you must follow the procedure found in section 470 of the MGA which requires an application for judicial review to be filed and served not more than 60 days after the date of the decision. Additional information may also be found at www.albertacourts.ab.ca.

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple Page 6 of 10

			Appendix A
0262	1187	CARB	30000931490 3901 50A Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB	30001620645 4514 48 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1191	CARB	30001620660 4813 46 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1188	CARB	30001620665 4823 46 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1189	CARB	30001620670 4827 46 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1186	CARB	30002032155 25 Howarth St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1202	CARB	30000920730 3110 47 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1203	CARB	30002321906 A 31 Timberstone WY, Red Deer, AB
0262	1204	CARB	30002321907 B 31 Timberstone WY, Red Deer, AB
0262	1205	CARB	30002330875 A 301 Timothy DR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1206	CARB	30002330876 B 301 Timothy DR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1207	CARB	30002330877 C 301 Timothy DR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1216	CARB	30000920090 3010 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1219	CARB	30001410155 1840 49 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1220	CARB	30001410160 1824 49 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1193	CARB	30002941765 7414 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1194	CARB	30002941770 7424 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1232	CARB	30000422181 1890 49 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1197	CARB	30000540220 24 Signet Cl, Red Deer, AB
0262	1198	CARB	30000540235 2101 Seneca Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262	1211	CARB	30002332080 2000 499 Timberlands Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262	1223	CARB	30001620215 4909 49 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1183	CARB	30001620376 4901 48 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1222	CARB	30001620130 4902 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1200	CARB	30001620020 4822 51 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1199	CARB	30000920270 2840 Bremner Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1215	CARB	30002910120 6794 50 Ave, Red deer, AB
0262	1182	CARB	30002822785 6757 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1228	CARB	30000540190 4 5111 22 ST, Red Deer, AB
0262	1242	CARB	30002910155 6870 50 Av, Red Deer, AB
0262	1201	CARB	30000933055 3421 50 Av, Red Deer, AB
0262	1243	CARB	30002921780 6350 67 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1192	CARB	30002921815 6130 67 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1195	CARB	30003214635 7730 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1244	CARB	30002911735 6720 52 Av, Red Deer, AB
0262	1245	CARB	30002921785 15 6350 67 St, Red Deer, AB

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple Page 7 of 10

0262	1233	CARB	30000431645	2119 50 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1226	CARB	30000540130	2004 50 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1227	CARB	30000540155	200 5001 19 ST, Red Deer, AB
0262	1229	CARB	30000540195	5 5111 22 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1230	CARB	30000540200	5111 22 St, Red Deer, AB
0262	4224	CARR	20000540066	5250 22 CL D. LD. AD.
0262		CARB		5250 22 St, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		4407 50 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		7980 Edgar Industrial Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		8051 Edgar Industrial Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		8027 Edgar Industrial Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		8164 Edgar Industrial CL, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB	30003111020	7679 Edgar Industrial CRT, Red Deer, AB
0262	1185	CARB	30008800100	101 Burnt Park Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262	1250	CARB	30003111165	7730 Edgar Industrial CRT, Red Deer, AB
0262	1184	CARB	30003310515	7449 49 Ave CR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1217	CARB	30000931306	3310 50 Ave, Red Deer, AB
0262	1235	CARB	30000540125	2030 50 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1225	CARB	30001711485	5016 51 AV, Red Deer, AB
0262	1196	CARB	30000540215	15 Signet Cl, Red Deer, AB
0262	1218	CARB	30001130708	69 Dunlop St, Red Deer, AB
0262	1231	CARB	30000341900	3020 22 ST, Red Deer, AB
0262	1239	CARB	30002332055	200 500 Timberlands Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262	1208	CARB	30002332050	100 500 Timberlands DR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1209	CARB	30002332060	300 500 Timberlands DR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1221	CARB	30002332065	400 500 Timberlands Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262	1210	CARB	30002332070	500 500 Timberlands DR, Red Deer, AB
0262	1240	CARB	30002332085	3000 499 Timberlands Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262	1241	CARB		4000 499 Timberlands Dr, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		9000 499 Timberlands DR, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		10000 499 Timberlands DR, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		11000 499 Timberlands DR, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		63 Clearview Market WY, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		8 Conway St, Red Deer, AB
0262		CARB		3 Clearview Market WY, Red Deer, AB
	0	-		= = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = =

# Appendix B

Crite Library   Delication															
Roard Room 1		019	ugust 26, 20	Monday, A				ust 26, 2019	Monday, Aug				\ugust 26, 2019	Monday, A	
Board Room 1															
Board Room 1											Hospitality	000'00'10'8	Red Deer (City)		3000901306
Board Room 1											Industrial	\$2,307,300	Red Deer (City)		
Board Room 1											Industrial	\$6,203,200	Red Deer (City)		30003111165 77
											Industrial	96,984,500	Red Deer (City)		000000000000000000000000000000000000000
Board Room 1						Retail	\$24,946,900	Red Deer (City)	3020 22 Street	30000341900	Industrial	\$2,548,500	Red Deer (City)		300001110000
Board Room 1						Retail	\$19,150,500	Red Deer (City)	69 Dunlop Street	80/00/10000	Industrial	\$2,475,500	Red Deer (City)		30001213005 St
Board Room 1						Retail	\$19,596,300	Red Door (City)	15 Signet Close	30000540215	Industrial	50,344,600	Red Deer (City)		
Board Room 1						Retail	\$20,764,700	Red Deer (City)	3016 51 Ave	30001711485	Industrial	\$6,017,400	Red Deer (City)		30003110305
Board Room 1						Retail	\$21,783,100	Red Deer (City)	-	30000540125	Industrial	\$2,972,900	Red Deer (City)	60 Edgar Industrial Drive	20000110000
Boland Room 1   Boland Room 2   Boland Room 2   Boland Room 3   Boland Room		019	ugust 19, 20	Monday, A				rust 19, 2019	Monday, Aug				\ugust 19, 2019	Monday, A	
											Retail	\$12,743,200	Red Deer (City)		30001623565 44
											Retail	\$54,216,900	Red Deer (City)		30000540066 52
Red Albrect   Monedays, July 22, 2019											Retail	\$22,317,700	Red Deer (City)		30000540200 51
Roard Room 1											Retail	\$9,457,500	Red Deer (City)		30000540595
Roll Albridge   Manifeyer											Retail	\$50,426,700	Red Deer (City)		30000540035 20
Board Room 1											Retail	\$49,402,300	Rod Deer (City)		1
											Metail	\$7,300,500	Red Deer (City)		₽.
Board Room 1         Monday publy 22, 2019         2013 ASART         Property Type         Roll Newber         Chiefe Address         Monday (high party)         2013 ASART         Property Type         Roll Newber         Chiefe Address         Monday (high party)         2013 ASART         Property Type         Sold New Comm 3         Monday (high party)         2013 ASART         Property Type         Bod Incentional Assertional Assertio		CTO	agust 14, 40	monday, n				ust 12, 2019	asonday, Aug				August 12, 2019		-
		210		1				2010	Y-				2000	W	
											Retail	\$9,434,400	Red Deer (Cay)		30002921790 13
Property Type   Property Ty											Messa	37,767,000	sod Deer (Cary)		L
Board Room 1											Retail	96,909,900	Red Deer (City)		١.
		l									Metail	\$7,579,100	Red Deer (City)		١.
		l									Retail	\$4,417,900	Red Deer (City)		١.
Property   Property											Metail	\$1,712,000	Red Deer (City)		١.,
Property Type   Property Ty											Metall	\$1,340,600	Red Deer (Cary)		μ.
											Metail	\$0,418,500	find Deer (City)		┸
Board Room 1		l									Metall	94,346,300	Red Deer (Cary)		┺
Board Room 1			ĺ								Retail	\$6,367,400	Red Deer (City)		_
Property   Property Type   P		9	July 29, 201	Monday,				ry 29, 2019	Monday, Ju				July 29, 2019		Į.
Property   Property		5						20.00					2000		
Board Room 1		-									Multi-Residential	_	Red Deer (City)		30002330877 C
Property   Property											Multi-Residential	_	Rod Deer (City)		L
Property   Property Type   P											Multi-Residential		Red Deer (City)		30002300875 A
Board Room 1						Land	\$536,000	Red Deer (City)	2000, 499 Tamberlands Drive	30002332000	Multi-Residential		Red Deer (City)		30002323907 8,
Property Type		1				Land	\$2,100,900	Red Deer (City)	2101 Seneca Drive	30000540235	Multi-Residential	_	Red Deer (City)		4
Property Type   Property Typ		+	+			Land	\$2,100,200	Red Deer (City)	24 Suppet Close	30000540220	Multi-Residential	_	Red Deer (City)		4
Property Type   Roll Number   Clinic Address   Montripality   2019 ASMT   Property Type   Roll Number   Clinic Address   Montripality   2019 ASMT   Type		†	The second second	100000000000000000000000000000000000000	A STREET, COLORIDA	Automotive	\$7,441,100	Red Door (City)	1890 49 Ave	30000422181	Multi-Residential	$\neg$	Red Deer (City)		-
Property Type   Roll Number   Clinic Address   Manicipality   2019 ASMT   Property Type   Roll Number   Clinic Address   Manicipality   2019 ASMT   Type		†	Red Deer (Circ	SAO Business Ave	000000000	Automotive	81 979 100	Bod Dwer (Clav)	200 A CO A	00711950000	Multi Recidential	7	Red Deer (Clay)		4
		†	Red Deer (Circ	4822 SO Ave	30001630000	_	\$2,467,000	Bod Door (City)	7414 50 Ave	30002941765	Multi-Residential	_	Red Deer (City)		4
Property Type   Roll Number   Civic Address   Montripality   2019 ASMT   Property Type   Roll Number   Civic Address   Montripality   2019 ASMT   Type		†	Red Deer (City	4902 SQ Ave	00.000310000	-	84.367.300	Red Deer (City)	SOA 69 AVE	30001410140	Multi-Recidential	7	Red Deer (City)		4
ic Address Mencicipality 2019 ASAG Property Type Roll Number Cinic Address Municipality 2019 ASAG Type  Board Room 1  Board Room 2  Board Room 2  Monday, July 22, 2019  Monday, July 22, 2019  Statistic Madress Municipality 2019 ASAG Type  Board Room 3  Monday, July 22, 2019  Monday, July 23, 2019  Statistic Madress Municipality 2019  Monday, July 23, 2019  Monday, July 23, 2019  Monday, July 23, 2019  Monday, July 24, 2019  Monday, July 24, 2019  Monday, July 25, 2019  Monday, July 24, 2019  Monday, July 25, 2019  Monday, July 26, 2019  Monday, July 26, 2019  Monday, July 26, 2019  Monday, July 27, 2019  Monday, July 28, 2019		†	Red Deer (C)	4901 48 Street	3000163036			Red Deer (City)	1940 49 Ave	30001410155	Multi-Residential		Red Deer (City)		_
Municipality 2019 ASMT Property Type Roll Number Civic Address Mandripality 2019 ASMT Property Type Roll Number Civic Address Mandripality 2019 ASMT Property Type Roll Number Civic Address Mandripality Type Board Room 3  Monday, July 22, 2019 Monday, July 22, 2019		1	Red Deer (City		30001620215			Red Deer (City)		3000090090	Multi-Residential		Red Deer (City)		900000000000000000000000000000000000000
Municipality 2019 ASMT Property Type Roll Number Civic Address Mandripality 2019 ASMT Property Roll Number Civic Address Mandripality Sourd Room 1  Board Room 2  Roll Number Civic Address Mandripality 2019 ASMT Type  Board Room 3		9	luly 22, 201	Monday,				ly 22, 2019	Monday, Jul				July 22, 2019	Monday,	ı
Municipality 2019 ASMT Property Type Roll Number Civic Address Manicipality 2019 ASMT Property Roll Number Civic Address Manicipality		ω	Room 3	Board				oom 2	Board R				Room 1	Board	
Property		_	Manucipal	Clinic Address	Roll Niconber	Type	2019 ASMT	Montopulity	Cavie Address	Roll Nicmber	Property Type		Manicipality		Kpili Namber
	_					Property									

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple Page 9 of 10

Roll Number Civic Address	Manicipality 20	2019 ASMT Property Type	perty Type	Roll Number	Civic Address	Monicipality	2019 ASMT	Property	Roll Number	Civic Address	Maai	Municipality
1	Board Room 1				Board Room 2	Room 2				Board Room 3	Ro	om 3
Tues	Tuesday, September 3, 2019				Tuesday, September 3, 2019	ember 3, 2019				Tuesday, September 3, 2019	ten	nber 3, 201
Мол	Monday, September 9, 2019				Monday, September 9, 2019	ember 9, 2019				Monday, September 9, 2019	tem	ber 9, 201
											Ħ	
Mon	Monday, September 16, 2019				Monday, September 16, 2019	ember 16, 201	9			Monday, September 16, 2019	temt	er 16, 20
		+									Ħ	
Mon	Monday, September 23, 2019				Monday, September 23, 2019	ember 23, 201	9			Monday, September 23, 2019	eml	ber 23, 20
30002332055 200, 500 Timberlands Drive	Red Deer (City)	\$6,271,100	Retail									
30002332050 100, 500 Timberlands Drive	Red Deer (City)	\$2,087,300	Retail								f	
30002332060 300, 500 Timberlands Drive	Red Deer (City)	\$2,187,100	Retail								f	
	Red Deer (City)	\$3,464,400	Retail								f	
_		\$2,797,600	Retail								f	
		\$9,096,700	Retail			Ī					f	
30002332090 4000, 499 Timberlands Drive		\$3,263,700	Retail								Ŧ	
┸	e Red Deer (City)	\$3,544,600	Retail			1					Ŧ	
		\$1,671,000	Retail									
30002212020 63 Clearview Market Way		\$10,244,000	Retail									
30002212045 8 Conway Street			Retail									
		\$34,227,500				T						

Complaint ID 1182 - 1251 Roll No. Multiple Page 10 of 10

# **Appendix C**

Documents presented at the Hearing and considered by the Board.

- 1. C.1 Complainant's Preliminary Hearing Argument Submission (199 pages)
- 2. C.2 Complainant's Proposed Hearing Schedule (3 pages)
- 3. C. 3 Respondent's Proposed Hearing Schedule (3 pages)
- 4. R.1 Respondent's Preliminary Hearing Submission (no page numbers)
- 5. R.3 Assessment Review Board Complaints (no page numbers)
- 6. R.4 Respondent's Proposed Hearing Schedule (3 pages)